



SAN DIEGO  
COMMUNITY COLLEGE  
DISTRICT

City College • Mesa College • Miramar College  
College of Continuing Education

# Zero Textbook Cost Success Rate Update, Fall 2023

Student Textbook Affordability Committee

May 1, 2024

Presented by Steve Bass, [sbass@sdccd.edu](mailto:sbass@sdccd.edu)

# Context

## ZTC Data Source

This briefing includes section count and success rate data for Zero Textbook Cost (ZTC) sections at San Diego City, Mesa, and Miramar Colleges in Fall 2023.

ZTC data in this presentation is sourced from a Campus Solutions query that identifies sections shown in the online course registration system with a ZTC logo; this functionality is not supported for the College of Continuing Education.

# Context

## Metrics & Definitions

- **On-ground:** Students and professors occupy the same physical location at the same time. Not considered Distance Education.
- **Online & On-ground:** Students participate both online and on-ground. Considered Distance Education.
- **Online:** Students and professors do not occupy the same physical location at the same time. Includes online-live, fully online courses, and Hyflex courses. Considered Distance Education.
- **Success rate:** The percent of enrollments out of total census enrollments that receive a passing grade. ZTC success rates shown for comparable courses only (subset of total ZTC sections).

# ZTC Section Counts

## By Modality

- City: 173, 15% of total. Online: 89, 21%
- Mesa: 191, 10% of total. Online: 82, 12%
- Miramar: 99, 9%. Online: 41, 10%
- Credit College Total: 463, 11% of total. Online: 212, 14%
- Success rates on next slide shown for 369 sections across credit colleges in comparable courses.

# ZTC Success Rates

## By Modality

Table 3. Success Rates in ZTC and non-ZTC courses, comparable sections

		On-ground	Online & On-ground	Online	Overall
City College	ZTC	74%	69%	71%	72%
	non-ZTC	66%	55%	66%	65%
	<b>Total</b>	<b>68%</b>	<b>56%</b>	<b>68%</b>	<b>66%</b>
Mesa College	ZTC	72%	65%	76%	73%
	non-ZTC	69%	77%	72%	71%
	<b>Total</b>	<b>70%</b>	<b>75%</b>	<b>73%</b>	<b>72%</b>
Miramar College	ZTC	76%	55%	74%	72%
	non-ZTC	77%	80%	73%	75%
	<b>Total</b>	<b>77%</b>	<b>74%</b>	<b>73%</b>	<b>74%</b>
Credit College	ZTC	73%	60%	74%	72%
	non-ZTC	70%	71%	71%	70%
	<b>Total</b>	<b>70%</b>	<b>69%</b>	<b>71%</b>	<b>71%</b>

Note. Excludes courses that were not offered in both ZTC and non-ZTC formats in Fall 2023.

Table 3 above shows success rates in courses that were offered in both ZTC and non-ZTC formats. The success rate for *all* ZTC sections in Fall 2023 was 73% (City: 73%, Mesa: 73%, Miramar: 72%).

**Overall success rates were 2% higher in ZTC sections than non-ZTC sections in Fall 2023.**

# ZTC Success Rates

## By Ethnicity

Table 4. Success Rates in ZTC and non-ZTC courses by Ethnicity, comparable sections

		On-ground	Online & On-ground	Online	Overall
African American	ZTC	65%	49%	70%	67%
	non-ZTC	63%	58%	63%	62%
	Total	63%	57%	65%	63%
Asian	ZTC	84%	75%	86%	84%
	non-ZTC	77%	85%	85%	83%
	Total	79%	83%	85%	83%
Latinx	ZTC	69%	53%	69%	68%
	non-ZTC	64%	64%	65%	64%
	Total	65%	62%	66%	65%
White	ZTC	88%	83%	82%	84%
	non-ZTC	78%	82%	77%	78%
	Total	81%	83%	78%	80%

Note. Excludes courses that were not offered in both ZTC and non-ZTC formats in Fall 2023.

# ZTC and Equity

## By Ethnicity

- African American success was 5% higher in ZTC sections in Fall 2023
- Latinx success was 4% higher
- **These groups indicated in a Fall 2023 survey that the availability of Open Educational Resources (OER) and ZTC was more important in their enrollment decisions than other groups did .**
- These findings are evidence that ZTC course offerings and clear messaging about their availability are important to equitable course access and outcomes.

Table 4. Success Rates in ZTC and non-ZTC courses by Ethnicity, comparable sections

		On-ground	Online & On-ground	Online	Overall
African American	ZTC	65%	49%	70%	67%
	non-ZTC	63%	58%	63%	62%
	Total	63%	57%	65%	63%
Asian	ZTC	84%	75%	86%	84%
	non-ZTC	77%	85%	85%	83%
	Total	79%	83%	85%	83%
Latinx	ZTC	69%	53%	69%	68%
	non-ZTC	64%	64%	65%	64%
	Total	65%	62%	66%	65%
White	ZTC	88%	83%	82%	84%
	non-ZTC	78%	82%	77%	78%
	Total	81%	83%	78%	80%

Note. Excludes courses that were not offered in both ZTC and non-ZTC formats in Fall 2023.

# ZTC and Equity

## By Ethnicity

- African American success was 5% higher in ZTC sections in Fall 2023
- Latinx success was 4% higher
- **These groups indicated in a Fall 2023 survey that the availability of Open Educational Resources (OER) and ZTC was more important in their enrollment decisions than other groups did .**
- These findings are evidence that ZTC course offerings and clear messaging about their availability are important to equitable course access and outcomes.

Table 4. Success Rates in ZTC and non-ZTC courses by Ethnicity, comparable sections

		On-ground	Online & On-ground	Online	Overall
African American	ZTC	65%	49%	70%	67%
	non-ZTC	63%	58%	63%	62%
	Total	63%	57%	65%	63%
Asian	ZTC	84%	75%	86%	84%
	non-ZTC	77%	85%	85%	83%
	Total	79%	83%	85%	83%
Latinx	ZTC	69%	53%	69%	68%
	non-ZTC	64%	64%	65%	64%
	Total	65%	62%	66%	65%
White	ZTC	88%	83%	82%	84%
	non-ZTC	78%	82%	77%	78%
	Total	81%	83%	78%	80%

Note. Excludes courses that were not offered in both ZTC and non-ZTC formats in Fall 2023.



# Context

## Distance Education Experience Survey, Fall 2023

- In Fall 2023, all students in a distance education course at SDCCD were invited to a survey the online experience.
- 3,135 students responded (~6% response rate)
  - 1,068 respondents were enrolled only at one or more of the credit colleges (34% of respondents)
  - 990 were only enrolled at SDCCE (32%)
  - 74 (2%) were enrolled at both SDCCE and at least one of the credit colleges
  - 1,068 respondents did not indicate which college they were enrolled at in Fall 2023.

# Context

## Distance Education Experience Survey, Fall 2023

- In Fall 2023, all students in a distance education course at SDCCD were invited to a survey the online experience.
- 3,135 students responded (~6% response rate)
  - 1,068 respondents were enrolled only at one or more of the credit colleges (34% of respondents)
  - 990 were only enrolled at SDCCE (32%)
  - 74 (2%) were enrolled at both SDCCE and at least one of the credit colleges
  - 1,068 respondents did not indicate which college they were enrolled at in Fall 2023.

# ZTC Class Search

- 25% of respondents were aware of the (ZTC) filter when using the class search. This varies by:
  - **College:** Students enrolled at multiple credit college were more likely to be aware of the ZTC filter (45%) than students enrolled at only one of the colleges (City Only: 27%, Mesa: 29%, Miramar: 26%, SDCCE: 19%).
  - **Age Group:** Older students were less likely to be aware of the filter than younger students.
  - **Academic Area of Major:** Students with Undeclared/Undecided majors were least likely to be aware (25%), followed by Art/Graphic Design students (28%). Psychology students were most likely to be aware (48%).

# Importance of Free Materials

- The availability of free course materials was moderately important in students' decisions to enroll (3.6 out of 5.0).
- This varies by:
  - **Academic Area of Major:** Open Education Resources (OER)/ZTC was least important to Engineering majors (3.53) and most important to those in Child Development (4.30) and those with Undeclared/Undecided majors (4.28).
  - **Race:** Latina/o/e/x and Black or African American students indicated that OER/ZTC was more important (4.15 and 4.18, respectively) than other groups (i.e. white: 2.99, Asian: 3.65).

# ZTC Survey Responses by Group, 1 of 2

Table 14. OER, ZTC, and LCC Student Survey Responses by Demographic

		Average Online Sentiment			Total Respondents
		Aware of ZTC Class Search (0-100%)	OER/ZTC important for enrollment (1-5)	OER Materials were Representative (1-5)	
<b>Overall Average</b>		<b>25%</b>	<b>3.60</b>	<b>4.07</b>	<b>2,210</b>
College Enrolled	City Only	27%	3.91	4.03	303
	Mesa Only	29%	3.70	4.04	361
	Miramar Only	26%	3.75	4.08	227
	More than 1 Credit	45%	3.99	4.05	174
	SDCCE Only	19%	3.32	4.11	985
Age Group	18 - 24	35%	3.93	3.98	304
	25 - 34	38%	4.14	4.11	322
	35 - 44	30%	4.02	4.16	389
	45 - 54	25%	4.09	4.07	274
	55 - 64	23%	3.63	4.13	257
	65+	10%	2.47	3.97	549
Race	White	17%	2.99	4.07	742
	Latina/o/e/x	30%	4.15	4.13	434
	Black/African American	31%	4.18	4.12	287
	Asian	29%	3.65	4.13	266
	Multiple Ethnicities	33%	3.57	3.94	125

# ZTC Survey Responses by Group, 2 of 2

Table 14. OER, ZTC, and LCG Student Survey Responses by Demographic

		Average Online Sentiment			Total Respondents
		Aware of ZTC Class Search (0-100%)	OER/ZTC important for enrollment (1-5)	OER Materials were Representative (1-5)	
<b>Overall Average</b>		<b>25%</b>	<b>3.60</b>	<b>4.07</b>	<b>2,210</b>
Academic Area of Major	Business	37%	4.15	4.14	175
	Computer Science	33%	4.08	4.15	87
	Child Development	33%	4.30	4.15	84
	Undeclared/Undecided	25%	4.28	4.14	79
	Nursing or pre-Nursing	33%	4.05	4.20	80
	Biology or Allied Health	36%	4.05	4.02	77
	Psychology	48%	3.97	4.06	64
	Engineering/Pre Eng.	31%	3.53	3.75	36
	Art/Graphic Design	28%	4.19	3.78	32
Ed. Objective	Ed. Development	14%	3.09	4.06	612
	Transfer/Associate	36%	3.97	4.03	599
	Prepare for a new job	31%	4.15	4.21	262
	CTE Cert, no Transfer	28%	4.04	4.16	156
	Maintain cert.	37%	4.13	4.10	90
	Personal Enrichment	13%	2.66	4.13	88
	Currently enrolled in 4-yr	39%	4.36	4.17	59
	Physical Exercise	2%	1.63	4.00	42



SAN DIEGO  
COMMUNITY COLLEGE  
DISTRICT

THANK YOU

SAN DIEGO  
CITY COLLEGE

SAN DIEGO  
MESA COLLEGE

SAN DIEGO  
MIRAMAR  
COLLEGE

SAN DIEGO COLLEGE OF  
CONTINUING EDUCATION